

**GRAND HAVEN CHARTER TOWNSHIP BOARD  
MONDAY, JANUARY 12, 2016  
Grand Haven High School Field House/Gymnasium**

**SPECIAL MEETING – 6:00 P.M.**

I. CALL TO ORDER

Supervisor French called the special meeting of the Grand Haven Charter Township Board to order at 6:12 p.m.

II. PLEDGE TO THE FLAG

III. ROLL CALL

**Board members present:** French, Larsen, Behm, Hutchins, Meeusen, and Kieft.  
**Board members absent:** Hutchins.

Also present were Manager Cargo, Planner Fedewa, and Attorney Bultje.

IV. APPROVAL OF MEETING AGENDA

**Motion** by Clerk Larsen and seconded by Treasurer Kieft to approve the meeting agenda.  
**Which motion carried.**

V. APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA

1. Approve December 14, 2015 Board Minutes
2. Approve Payment of Invoices in the amount of \$773,285.45 (A/P checks of \$566,522.71 and payroll of \$206,762.74)

**Motion** by Treasurer Kieft and seconded by Trustee Meeusen to approve the items listed on the Consent Agenda. **Which motion carried.**

VI. PUBLIC HEARING

1. Opening Statement – Supervisor French opened the Health Pointe PUD hearing at 6:13 p.m. and welcomed the public and noted the general format for the public hearing.
2. Legal Review & Process – Attorney Bultje noted that the Health Pointe PUD Amendment application is a zoning decision, to be made under the terms of the Zoning Ordinance. The Board should not be engaged in either preventing or promoting competition in the health care industry. He emphasized this PUD application has not been rushed through the zoning process. It has reached the Board only after months of meetings between the applicant and staff, and then months of meetings between the applicant and the Planning Commission. There was also a public hearing before the Planning Commission, although not required by the State law. The applicant is not asking for permission to violate the Zoning Ordinance. Rather, in the PUD context, state law and the Zoning Ordinance both contemplate

that certain technical aspects of the Zoning Ordinance will be relaxed in return for the benefits of the PUD development.

Attorney Bultje also addressed the Zoning Ordinance amendments being considered by the Planning Commission. The Planning Commission directed staff to prepare these amendments, pertaining to building height and commercial uses, at the same meeting when the Planning Commission recommended approval of this PUD. He stated these two objectives have been included in the Township's master plan for years. He stated that the Board could legitimately decide this PUD application on the basis of the Zoning Ordinance as it is currently stated, or the Board could legitimately wait for the two amendments to be acted upon before the Board makes a decision on this PUD application.

3. Planning & Zoning Review – Planner Fedewa provided a Power Point presentation on the proposed Health Pointe PUD Amendment application, a copy of which will be placed in the Health Pointe file.
4. Applicant's Review & Explanation
  - a. Jeff Meyers (648 Monroe Avenue, NW, Suite 410, Grand Rapids, 49503) is the Director of Real Estate Development for Spectrum Health. He noted that this is joint venture with Holland Hospital; that the review process began in March of 2015; believes it complies with the applicable aspects of the Zoning Ordinance and that Spectrum has attempted to conform; there was a pre-application meeting with the Planning Commission in September; a formal application was made in October; November held a public hearing at the Planning Commission; December the Planning Commission recommended approval of the Health Pointe PUD application. Requested that the Board act on the application in a timely fashion.
  - b. David Ottenbaker (17142 Majestic Court, GHT) is a family physician with Spectrum practicing in the City of Grand Haven. Spectrum has 20 providers located at the existing facility and has about 20,000+ patients; a community health needs study lists needs for additional primary care physicians and additional specialty care physicians; Health Pointe is designed to keep health care local with about 250 employees that will work at this proposed facility; Health Pointe is a new model of care that will provide primary, specialty and ancillary care at a single patient-centric facility designed to reduce health care costs; 80% of patient needs will be able to be met at this facility; but, it is not a hospital and the Health Pointe facility is willing to collaborate with NOCH.
  - c. Mark Pawlak (8953 North Clearwater Drive, Zeeland) is a member of the Holland Hospital executive team. Health Pointe is a 50/50 joint venture between Spectrum and Holland Hospital; will extend a new level of care with a more fully integrated health care facility that will provide new health care opportunities; Health Pointe emerged as a result of several factors including that patients are already traveling to Spectrum and Holland Hospital for service and that a needs assessment identified additional health care needs in this area; will provide primary care physicians, specialty care physicians, urgent care, out-patient surgery, laboratory services and radiology services; will provide a local option to reverse a trend of having to leave the area for specialty care.

- d. Jack Barr (217 Grandville Avenue, SW, Grand Rapids, 49503) is a civil engineer and planning consultant. Noted that there is a departure of two feet on the curb islands, which is designed to better protect vehicles; noted that the departure on parking (i.e., from 484 to 577) is based upon a parking study; noted that the ground signs are higher than current rules allow by about thirty inches; noted that landscaping exceeds requirements; noted that Health Pointe will provide an easement to allow the possible re-alignment of Whitaker Way and Despelder; noted that Health Pointe will add access points to its parking areas so the parking can be back-loaded; noted that the plans have been modified to provide curb and gutter on the relocated service road.
- e. Sean Easter (179 Eunavista Drive, Holland) is an architect. Noted that the building is a three-story facility (as opposed to a two and one-half story) and is 44' high with a 10' screen on the top of a section of the building to screen mechanical equipment; noted that a three-story building has a shorter circulation pattern for patients; noted that the portion of the Master Plan addressing the Robbins Road area recommends higher buildings; provided renderings that show the perspective is appropriate; noted that exterior materials meet the zoning requirements.

5. Public Written Comments

- a. Written Comments – Cargo noted that the Township has received twenty-two (22) letters and emails regarding the Health Pointe PUD amendment application, which will be retained with this PUD amendment application file. A brief summary of the letters follows:
  - 1. Letter from Karen Shears dated January 6, 2016 noted that she does not believe the project is in the best interests of the Township.
  - 2. Letter from Marc Chircop (Board Chair and President of Health Pointe, Inc.) and Dale Sowders (Board Vice Chair of Health Pointe, Inc.) dated January 6, 2015 noted the fundamentals of the project.
  - 3. Email from Cathy Brolick dated January 6, 2016 expressed concerns regarding traffic congestion and the impact of the proposed development.
  - 4. Letter from E. William S. Shipman dated December 14, 2015 noted the bylaws of the NOCH Articles of Incorporation.
  - 5. Letter from Shelleye Yaklin dated December 14, 2015 questioned how the Health Pointe facility would impact the community and whether it fit under all of the zoning perimeters.
  - 6. Email from Clare and Mary Stephens dated December 12, 2015 support the proposed facility.
  - 7. Letter from Pamela Tysman dated December 11, 2015 requested that the Board delay a decision on the facility until additional information is provided.
  - 8. Letter from Jack and Margie Steinmetz dated December 11, 2015 urged a no vote on each exception requests.
  - 9. Letter from Julie Hordyk dated December 10, 2015 urged a delay on the vote and institute further review of the proposal.
  - 10. Letter from Stephen Marotti dated December 10, 2015 urged a delay on the vote and institute further review of the proposal.
  - 11. Email from Kristin Turkelson dated December 10, 2015 encouraged that the applicant continue to work on the design of the project.

12. Letter from Katie Appold dated December 8, 2015 noted that Love INC has a vested interest in supporting a health care model that is locally-focused and fueled and requested that additional information be provided.
  13. Letter from Barbara Ambrose dated December 8, 2015 requested that the process be slowed and make the applicant adhere to all rules and regulations.
  14. Email from Carol Kirchner dated December 7, 2015 requested that the approval process be slowed to examine what is behind the proposed facility.
  15. Letter from Lody Zwarenstejn of Grand Rapids (undated) expressed questions regarding the growth and size of Spectrum Health and the impact on smaller health care providers.
  16. Letter from Robert and Sehoy Brown (undated) appeals for greater transparency and time to assess the scope of the project.
  17. Letter from Betty Bierman (undated) expressed concerns and questions regarding the proposed Health Pointe facility and requested that the Board consider its decision before granting the request.
  18. Letter from James and Sharon Van Dyke (undated) expressed concerns on the long-term impact of the proposed facility on Township and surrounding communities.
  19. Email from Barbara Collins dated December 3, 2015 does not prefer a bigger hospital.
  20. Email from Tom Wolfe dated December 3, 2015 noted that the expansion of Spectrum into the area could be good or bad.
  21. Letter from Glen Krasinski dated December 2, 2015 noted that this facility could weaken NOCH and prevent a wider range of services being done locally and urged a delay to explore every option.
  22. Letter from Harold and Joyce Weaver requested that the process be slowed to allow for more community involvement and information regarding Spectrum's plans.
- b. Verbal Comments – Comments from members of the public included the following:
1. Don Longpre (1725 Dykhouse, City of Grand Haven) provided a letter from Walter S. Wheeler III that noted the State of Michigan will not review this proposed project, other than the imaging facility; the review must be completed by the locals.
  2. Phil Leach (15518 Pine Street, Grand Haven Township) supports the Health Pointe facility for higher quality care.
  3. Mary Bandoock (14848 Spring Lake Township) supports new facility for the specialized medical care that will be provided.
  4. Marva Ringelberg (14230 Lakeshore Drive, Grand Haven Township) employed by Holland Hospital; witnessed collaborative efforts of Spectrum and Holland Hospital provided good results; supports the proposal; strong Spectrum physicians are already in the community.
  5. Lynn Richardson (2350 Three Mile Road, Walker) is with the Meijer real estate group and provided a letter from Kurt Adams (Director of Meijer Property Management) that supports the enhanced health care the facility will provide.
  6. Holly Lookabaugh-Deur (owner of Generation Care) noted that approval for

her facility in the Township took ten months; noted this is about business; noted her building was not allowed to be built higher; does not believe it will lower health care costs.

7. Mark Reenders (16616 Warner, Grand Haven Township) believes that the recommended approval of the Health Pointe facility is inconsistent with past practice wherein departures were not provided; provided a letter from attorney Randall Kraker that opines that the Health Pointe PUD is not a permitted use within a Commercial PUD.
8. Joyce Weaver (13840 Stearns Court, Robinson Township) believes the area is too congested, believes a new fire truck will be needed, violates wetlands, believes residents should vote on the proposal, will compete with NOCH and is too large.
9. Geri McCaleb (1235 Slayton, Grand Haven City) is representing both herself and the City of Grand Haven government. Noted that NOCH is a 501 3(c) organization and one of the largest employers; specialized care can go to Muskegon or Grand Rapids, wants to protect the community based hospital; requested to slow the process; concerned with duplication of services; questioned whether a traffic study was completed and a storm water study.
10. Jack Steinmetz (15695 High Ridge Drive, Grand Haven Township) stated he is a member of the NOCH Board; requested the Health Pointe facility be denied; concerned about the size and scope of the request; will be a sprawling eyesore; no benefits to accommodate the whims of Spectrum and Holland Hospital.
11. Judy Hooyenga (17515 Ridgemoor Court #105, Grand Haven Township) stated is a member of the NOCH Board and a health care attorney. She is opposed to the application; The Township has a fiduciary responsibility to care for NOCH; all of the services are a duplication of what is provided by NOCH; the facility will weaken NOCH; all non-Spectrum physicians will be hurt.
12. Dennis Dryer (626 Clinton Avenue, City of Grand Haven) asked whether the facility would be tax exempt. Cargo noted that this would not be a consideration in processing the PUD amendment application. Meyers does not know since it would have to seek state authorization and there are examples of similar facilities not being granted a tax exempt status.
13. David TenCate (11371 Oak Grove, Grand Haven Township) noted that he supports NOCH; but likes the larger facility with specialties nearby; expressed concern with zoning consistency.
14. Jack Roossien (14282 Lindbrook, Robinson Township) is the Chair of the NOCH Board. Opposed to the proposed Health Pointe facility. Health Care is constrained by the national government with regards to competition; Spectrum is using a predatory model; collaboration with Spectrum does not work; Spectrum will not cooperate with NOCH; requests a six month economic study of the Health Pointe facility; a three month review of the information by the surrounding communities.
15. Kay Aardema (17809 Dewberry Place, Grand Haven Township) is a local physician employed by NOCH. Wants the Board to deny the Health Pointe

facility; Spectrum will not support local businesses; will remove finance, tax base and charitable giving from the community; NOCH is an excellent facility; is concerned with staff recruitment and believes that many of the specialists will be housed at the main Spectrum facility.

16. Joe Ortiz (16923 Shady Dunes, Grand Haven Township) is a physician employed by Spectrum. This project is a 50/50 collaboration by Holland Hospital and Spectrum that will improve specialty care in the area; will be more efficient with integrated specialty services; will provide teaching for MSU students.
17. Jessica Finn (City of Muskegon) is employed by Spectrum and works at the local offices. The Health Pointe project will house medical specialties that do not currently exist in the area. There is a need for this project.
18. Amy Carlisle (424 Orchard, City of Grand Haven) supports the project; will provide health care as experienced by patients in Grand Rapids and Holland; believes that there is a great deal of misinformation regarding the project; wants to have additional specialized care; notes that many of the services are currently offered by Spectrum in the existing office structure.
19. Kent Vanderlaan (15307 Leonard, Spring Lake Township) supports the project, tired of going to Grand Rapids for specialty services; NOCH cannot provide the types of specialty services offered by Spectrum; need a choice in health care.
20. Gary Robertson (16840 Landing Drive, City of Ferrysburg) is a retired physician and has previously served on the NOCH Board; seen NOCH grow; urges the Board to postpone action to examine the facts more fully and inform the neighboring communities; Health Pointe will destroy NOCH.
21. Heney Assaad (178 Independence Court, City of Muskegon) is employed by NOCH; NOCH is currently recruiting specialists.
22. Sylvia Foust (13322 Foust Drive, Robinson Township) is employed by NOCH as a payroll system's analyst. NOCH is a true gem; Spectrum doctors owe their success to NOCH; NOCH saved her husband's life; Health Pointe will be the beginning of the end for NOCH if approved.
23. Jen Vanskiver (7512 Treeline Drive, Southeast, Grand Rapids) is the Chief Communications officer for NOCH. NOCH has about 30 doctors and 900 employees; Health Pointe is not just a land issue; no one understands the impact of the proposed facility; there is a "lot" we don't know; wants to delay any decision.
24. Scott Alfree (516 Buena Vista, Spring Lake Village) wants to delay decision in order to collect additional data.
25. Shellee Yaklin (10287 Whitewood Drive, West Olive) is the president of NOCH. NOCH already integrates medical records and does the same with the Mercy system; Spectrum will not work with NOCH with regard to electronic records; NOCH is willing to work with Spectrum.
26. Jeff Beswick (13623 Hofma Court, Grand Haven Township) provided a letter that provided reasons to deny the facility; requested that the Board reject any departures

There being no further comments, Supervisor French closed the public hearing at 8:17 p.m.

VII. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS  
None

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

**Motion** by Treasurer Kieft and seconded by Clerk Larsen to adjourn the meeting at 8:18 p.m. **Which motion carried.**

Respectfully Submitted,

Laurie Larsen  
Grand Haven Charter Township Clerk

Karl French  
Grand Haven Charter Township Supervisor